PATTERN OF MEDICAL CARE FOR DIARRHEAL PATIENTS IN DACCA URBAN AREA

Moslemuddin Khan George T. Curlin Shahidullah



CHOLERA RESEARCH LABORATORY Dacca, Bangladesh August, 1977 (Reprinted June, 1978)

Scientific Report No. 2

FATTERN OF MEDICAL CARE FOR DIARRHEAD FATIENTS IN DACCA URBAN AREA

ЪУ

Dr. Moslemuddin khan, Investigator, Epidemiology Division Dr. George T. Curlin, Head, spidemiology Division Nd. Shahidullah, Supervisor, Community Studies Branch

> CHOLMRA RESIANCH LABORATORY G.F.O. Box 128, Dacca-2 Bangladesh

 $\mathbb{I}_{2^{*}}$

i dorada

The Cholera kesearch Laboratory (CRL) operates under a bilateral project agreement between the government of Bangladesh and the United States of America. Research activities of URL center on the inter-relationships between Harrheal disease, nutrition, fertility and their environmental determinants. Only issues two types of papers: scientific reports and working papers which demonstrate the type of research activity currently in progress at CRL. The views expressed in these papers are those of authors and do not necessarily represent views of the Cholera Research Laboratory. They should not be quoted without the permission of the authors.

The authors wish to thank Dr. W.F. Verwey for encouraging us to do this study. We acknowledge our gratitude to Dr. W. H. Nosley, the present Director of the UKL for providing publication facilities and to all other starf who are directly or indirectly associated with the study and the publication.

ABETRAUT

1

This study was conducted during 1974, '75 and '76. It was our interest to find out how people utilize the medical facilities available in the urban area, the types of people they consult and the amount spent per patient before coming to the Cholera mesearch haboratory (GRL) for treatment.

Among the cholera patients, 73.7% came directly to 341 without consulting anyone. Homeopaths were fairly commonly consulted for treating cholera in children but adults consulted qualified physicians frequently. Shigelicsis cases were treated more commonly outside (58%) than cholera (26.3%).

According to priority, tablets, mixtures, and capsules were prescribed for these patients. Only 2.3% of patients were treated with saline before coming to Onl though most of them were infused saline in Onl.

Same and the second

The average cost for treating a diarrhea case was Tk.12.50 for those who sought treatment outside. Including all those who did not seek treatment outside, it was Tk.4.70 only. The amount spent by people of different income groups was proportional to their income though apparently it was higher for higher income groups. As only 3.7% of the diarcheal patients attended the free city hospitals (other than ChL), these do not appear to be attractive to the people in general. The qualified physicians have to compete with the cheap homeopaths, pharmacists, quacks and the existing attitude in delivering their scientific allopathic medical care to the people.

-- 2 ---

Thrashiertch

Medical facilities are limited in Bangladesh. Host of the hospitals, medical institutions and pharmacies are located in the urban areas where only nine percent of the total population of the country resides. There are both qualified physicians and non-qualified quacks available in all areas of bacca city. The people can either use the free hospitals run by the dovernment or they can consult any private practitioner. The attitude and the ability of the urban people in availing of the medical facilities for treating diarrheal illness are not known. To understand the pattern of medical care the city people undertake before coming to the Chi. for treatment of diarrheal illness, we initiated the following investigation in 1974. The Cholera Research patoratory is the principal facility in pacea for treatment of diarrheal illness, although diarrhea cases are treated by as many as seven large hospitals in Jacca.

HET. ODULUGY

we based our study on Cab indoor and outdoor department (oid) patients. The patients were selected on the basis of (a) willingness to cooperate, (b) staying within the metropolitan area, (c) had been admitted in the Cab ward or treated in the Chi,

- ij -

(d) had a rectal swab (R.S.) taken for culture and (e) the detailed information being available from the patient or his/ her attendant. There were 776 male and 869 female diarrheal cases in the study of whom 1,588 were selected from the indoor and 57 from OPD from October, 1974 through December, 1976. The patients were questioned about the medical care they received before coming to the TRL, which included the types of hospitals and physicians they consulted, the types of medicines used and the amount spent for the doctors and medicines. The monthly income of each family was also recorded. The interviews were conducted by trained field workers and uniform questionnaires were filled in within some hours of their arrival to the hospital. Standard ORE techniques were used for isolation of pathogens from the rectal swabs. The culture results were later incorporated in the questionnaire form.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the age and sex of cholers, shigellosis and non-specific diarrhea cases interviewed. The total number of cases interviewed was 1,645 out of which there were 1,044 cholera, 112 shigella and 489 non-specific diarrhea cases.
The age and sex distribution were nearly identical to the distribution of the population in general. Of patients interviewed, 47% were male and 53% female.

- 4. --

. C.	- 1 T. J	1 1.4	-
Ľ	<u>, 1</u> ,1	11.04	, de

AGE	AND	SEX	Q'a'	PATIENTS	.INTERVIEWED	(1974 -	· 1976)
-----	-----	-----	------	----------	--------------	---------	---------

<u>1</u> → ₩ 20	·	M	ale			Fen	ale		**************************************	i Îna Île Înă Luin Tși în Antonia C ^a rtere
Åge	Cholera	Shigella	Others	Total	Cholerz	Shigelle	Others	Total	er. Total	Total rercent
0-4	87	18	93	198	71	22	64	157	355	21.5
5-9	131	11	. 30	172	101	3	23	127	299	18.2
10-19	115	5	24	144	96	7	29	132	276	16.8
2049	107	15	80	202	280	21	110	411	613	.37.3
50+	34	5	21	· 6 0	22	5	15	42	102	6.2
TOTAL	474	54	248	776	570	58	241	869	1645	100.0
PER- CENT	28.8	3.3	15.0	47.2	34.7	3.5	14.7	52.8	100.0	ngan,t 4-makilipin,ski,bit,∑anjkapin

Table 2 shows the places or persons from whom medical care was sought for cholera cases before coming to the Cill ward. Overall 26.3% of cases sought medical advice from some medical or allied personnel prior to coming to the Cill. Among those, seeking care elsewhere, 3.7% of the cases were either treated by or taken to hospitals, 33.9% to qualified physicians, 20.8% to pharmacists,

TAPLE	2	

OUTSIDE CONSULTATIONS FOR CHOLERA

Sex	22 	DAZILGU	ician	macy	raj	opath	X	۶.	iiple sult	Con	sulted	Not Cone	ulted
Age/	t	dsou	Phys	Phar	Kabi	Home	Quac	Othe	Mult	No.	%	No.	%
0-4	M	4	7	7	1	10	2	4	1	34	38.2	55	61.8
	F	<u> </u>	5	6		7	1	ť	1	19	27.1	51	72.9
M+	F	4	12	13	1	17	3	5	2	53	33.3	106	66.7
5-9	M	-	9	6	1	14	3	4	1	36	27.3	96	72.7
	F	1	· 8	5	1	3	1	1	2	18	18.0	82	82.0
M+	F	1	17	11	2	17	4	5	3	54	23.3	178	76.7
10-19	M	-	11	7	-	5	6	•••	3	26	23.6	84	76.4
	F	1	10	7	-	2	3	4	2	25	25.0	75	75.0
M+	F	1	21	14	-	7	9	4	5	51	24.3	159	75.7
20-49	M	-	11	3	-	6	2	2	2	22	21.4	81	78.6
	F	3	31	15	1	10	13	7	1	79	38.7	204	72.0
· M+	F	3	42	18	1	16	15	9	3	101	35.4	285	73.8
50+	М	—	3	3	1	2	1	1	-	11	32.3	23	67.7
	F	2	1	1		~	. —	14-		4	18.2	18	8178
M+	F	2,	4	4	1	2	1	1	- 16-0-	15	26.8	41	73.2
Total	M	4	41	26	3	37	14	11	7	129	27.6	339	72.4
	F	7	55	34	2	22	18	13	6	145	25.2	430	74.8
· M+	F	11	96	60	5	59	32	24	13	274	26.3	769	73.7
 %	3.	.7	33.9	20.8	1.8	20.4	11.4	8.4	4.7		متها والمحالية المحالية المحا		iyaya gina yafa a samaa waxa

--- 6 ---- •

1.8% to "kabirajs", 20.4% to homeopaths, 11% to non-qualified allopathic medical practitioners (quacks) and 8.4% to all other non-allopathic medical practitioners. The other cases directly came to CMD without consulting anyone. Children up to the age of nine were commonly taken to homeopaths for treating choleric diarrhea. For patients of the age groups 10 and over, physicians were consulted more often than other types of consultants. In 20.8% of the cases, pharmacists, and 11.4% of the cases "quacks" were consulted for treatment of cholera cases. The percentage of total consultation were alike except for the patients of ages between 50-39. In this group, the percentage seeking consultation (17.6%) was less than the average (26.3%). The rate of consultation outside CRL was less for females (58.8%) than for males (67.5%). Over four percent of the people consulted more than one source.

Table 3 shows the persons or places consulted for shigellosis cases. Among those who sought treatment of shigellosis, three percent of the patients were taken to hospitals, 41.4% to qualified physicians, 31.0% to Fharmacists, 4.3% to "Kabirajs", 13.1% to homeopaths, 3.0% to "quacks" and 4.3% to all other. In all, 58% or the patients consulted someone and 42% did not consult anyone. Nearly three percent

--- 7 ---

TABLE 3

OUTSIDE CONSULTATIONS FOR SHIGLLLA

/Sex	pitalised	aician	rmacy	irej	sopath	in the second	ен Ц	tiple sult	Cons	ulted	Not Cons	ulted
AGG	Hos	Phys	Fha	Kab	Нощ	Qua	Othe	Mult	No.	%	No.	%
0-4 M	-	6	4	1	- 3		· •		14	82.4	3	17.6
F	-	5	4	1	4			م یں.	14	60.9	9	39.1
M+F	-	11	8	2	7	-	~		28	70.0	12	30.0
5-9 M	1	2	1		1	-		***	5	41.7	7	58.3
F		• • •	1	-	**#	-	1	₩.	2	66.7	1	33.3
M+F	1	2	2	-444	1		1		7	46.7	8	53.3
10-19 M	-	-	2		Pre-	يە.ب	خني	· •••	`2	40.0	3	60.0
P		1	2		1		-	4 11	4	57.1	3	42.9
M+F		1	4	**	1		·	-	6	50.0	6	50.0
20-49 M	***	8	3	-	-	2	-	1	12	75.0	4	25.0
F	1	4	4	1		-	2	1	11	55.0	9	45.0
M+F	1	12	7	1		2	2	2	23	63.9	13	36.1
50+ M		1		***	-as-	-		` ~~	1	20.0	4	80.0
F	-	1	-		ntes -	-			2	33.3	4	67.7
M+F	+	2		-		-		~	2	20.0	8	80.0
Total M	1	17	10	1	4	2		1	34	61.8	21	38.2
F	1	11	11	; 2	5	~	3	1	32	55.0	26	45.0
M+F	2	28	21	3	9	2	3	2	66	58.4	47	41.6
× %	3.0	41.4	31.0	4.3	13.1	3.0	4.3	3.0		,		

of cases visited more than one consultant before coming to the CRL ward. The mate of consultation for patients aged 0-4 was 70; and for other ages, the rates were around average, except among older people, when the rate was lower.

- G

Table 4 shows the consultation pattern for unknown diarrhea cases. From this group, 6.4% of the patients were taken to hospitals, 34.4% to qualified physicians, 24.0% to pharmacists, 3.4% to "Kabirajs", 18.9% to homeopaths, 3.3% to quacks and 9.5% to all other. In all, 47.6% of the patients consulted someone before coming to the CRL ward. The rate of consultation is more or less identical (47.6) in all age groups. The exception was the females aged 20-39 in which only 38.5% sought consultation. Nearly 9% of the patients consulted more than one person.

int.

Table 5 shows the types of medicines prescribed and their rate of use outside CRL for treating different types of diarrhea. Taking medicine does not, however, mean a medical consultation for these cases. Of the drugs used, 15.5% were tablets (Sulfaguanidine), 11% mixtures, 8% capsules (Tetracycline), 7% Pulves, 7% coconut (dab) water, 2.5% amulets, 2.2% saline and 6% other medicines. Over 60% of the patients who used a medicine took more than one. Other medicines included injections, herbs and water blessed by priests, etc.

TABLE 4

٠

OUTSIDE CONSULTATIONS FOR UNKNOWN DIARRHEA

e/Sex		spitaliz	ysician	armacy	biraj	reopath	ack	hers	ltiple nsultati	Cons	ulted	Not Cons	ulte
Åg		я	ц н н	,ª ,	너	ir:	3	ő	200	No.	Fe	No.	%
0-4 I	М	2	22	7	3	15	1	6	9	48	52.2	44	47.
i	F	5	13	5		13	2	3	5	36	37.5	30	32.
M+1	F	7	35	12	3	29	3	9	14	84	53.2	74	46.
5-9 . 1	M	2	5	5	.1	i	aje.	2	•	16	55.2	13	44.
	F.	2	3	5	5 44	3		1		14	63.7	8	36.
M+.	F	4	8	10	1	4		3		30	58.8	21	41.
10-19	M	_	2	1	-	4	1	2	••••	10	40.0	15	60.
	F	1	3	5		1	1	2	1	12	78.6	16	21.
N+	F	1	5	6	~~	5	2	4	1	22	41.5	31	58.
20-49	M	1	18	12	3	2	2	2	3	. 37	48.0	40	52.
	F	2	17	14	1	7		4	1	44	40.0	69	60.
Mr	F	3	35	26	4	9	2	6	4	81	42.6	109	57.
50+	М	1	2	3	î	1	1	~	i	8	40.0	12	60.
	F	-	2	4		-		2		8	47.0	9	53.
М+	F	1	4	7	1	1	I	5	1	16	43.2	21	56.
Potal	M	6	4 9	28	8	24	5	12	13	119	49.0	124	51.
	F	10	38	33	1	24	. 3	12	7	114	46.3	132	53.
M+	F	16	97	61	9	48	8	24	20	233	47.6	256	52.

.

. . .

÷.,

.

TABLE 5

т [.]

,

·,

:

•

. .

. RATE OF USE OF MEDICINES FRICE TO CONING TO CRE BY DIAGNOLIS

	(1044	EKA Ceses)	ал. (112	Cases)		eses)		40ev 15)	:
a de la companya de la	No. Use	1. J.	Nc. Use	27 27	No. Use	Å	No. Use	1	
Saline	23	2.20	.04	1.79	12	2.45	57	10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 1	
Clucose	4	0.38	С	0.00		0.20	m	0.30	
Capsule	72	05 ° 9	16	14.29	- <u>1</u> -1	10.02	157	8.33	
Tablet	121	1. 200	64 67	28.57	102	20.86	255	15.50	
hixture	22	6.90	ŝ.	16.07	еђ Г	17.38	175	10.64	
rulves	2	5.84	5	6+93	46	9 -8 2			
Dab	5.4	5.12	a)	7.14	ó †	10.02	\$ 6	ић [** ф	-
Anulet	19	1.82	ŝ	1.79	20	4.09	4.	্য খ্য গ	•
Other	35	3.35	Q	7.14	5		95 55	96* 6	
None	753	72.13	r.1 1.1	41.96	245	49.90	1044	54* 9	

1

.

;

ı

Table 6 shows the average cost for treating patients by age. Among the patients those who consulted someone and purchased some drugs, the average cost involved for treating a case outside CRL was Tk.16.5 for cholera, Tk.15.5 for Shigellosis and Tk.18.0 for other diarrhea. These were identical for both male and female. The age-wise expenditure was identical although the cost was higher for people over nine years of age and lower for people less than nine and over 60 years of age.

Table 7 shows the cost of medical care for all diarrheal patients by income. The percentage income spent on treating an episode of diarrhea remained relatively constant regardless of income. The average amount spent for all diarrhea cases who sought treatment before coming to the CRL ward was Tk.7.2, Tk.14.5, and Tk.27.3 by the people from lower to higher income groups. Including those patients who did not or could not be treated outside, these rates were Tk.2.4, 6.1 and 15.3, respectively, per patient of lower to higher income groups.

DISCUSSION

We find from this study that 73.7% of cholera cases came directly to the CRL without consulting anyone. This is pro-

- 12 --

		COST OF	MEDIO	AL CARE	OUTSII	ULA PER	R FATIE BY AGE	AND SE	G THOSE	I SERVI	ING TRA	ATME	NT.		
2	Ch	olera	Ma Shige	le	Othe	rg .		Chole	TB	F Shi	emale gella	9	hers		
Ages	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	Average Cost for All Dx	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	No. Treated	Cost/ Patient	Average Cost for All Dx	1 + 3 Cost for (1) 05
0-4	23	11.4	10	11.1	4 V	16.8	14.3	19	8.4	13	12.0	25	17.0	13.0	
5-9	3	11.7	N	34.5	9	30.7	16.9	16	10.4	1	1	10	12.4)	14 44 - 1
10-19	NG	22.3	N	4.0	œ	4 4 5	19.3	23	24.6	4	5.0	10	14.4	19.5	19.,
20-49	21	16.7	ຒ	22.8	26	16.8	17.6	70	19.4	သ	20.9	32	19.3	19.5	18.9
50+	10	23.4		5.0	6	19.7	21.0	N	14.5		20.0	4	26.3	22.0	23.7
Total	108	15.9	23	16.3	92	18.0	16.8	130	17.4	26	14.0	81	17.5	17.1	17.0

т. П

•

•

١

TABLE 6

- 51 -

••

						- 11						
	- 77	Cost Patie	с. С	I	·	u^ ++ 	ł	;; ;;	• 53	• •	į.č.	
(נאס פעובדט	Combine	No. of Fatients	329	647	976(34%)	205	279	484 (42%)	06	- 55	185 (49,2)	
10) - IUU - 10	s.	Cost/ Patients	5.0		2.3	14.3	ı	7.7	27.6	ı) 20.ê	E
	Other	No. of Yztients	127	149	276(46%)	82	02	152 (54%	46		61 (75%	2
דאי בדאל נאבות	la	Cost/ Igtients	6.7	Ĩ) - 3.8	15.0	ł	5.5 (13.2	; a ~	2.5	
A PUR UIARE	Shigell	No. of Iatients	33	25	58(54%)	22	<u>بر</u> بریا	35 (63%	14	ۍ ۲	19 (74%	
ALE IN 2A	, , , , ,	Cost/ retients .	0•5	ı	2.4	14.5	ĩ	S•4	33.5	. .	2 1 1	
ס דאסועבו ז	Choler	No. of Fetients	1 69	473	642 (26%)	101	196	297 (34%)	30	75	105 (29,')	
COST C	Monthly	Tk.	(200 median) 300 or less Treated	Not Treated	Total(% treated)	(450 mečian) 301-600 total Treated	Not Treated	Total ($ \%$ treated)	(700 median) 600 or more Treated	Wot Treated	rotal	

bably due to the acuteness of the onset of cholera rather than an inability of patients to afford treatment elsewhere. The proportion of cholera cases seeking treatment elsewhere in wealthier families was approximately the same as in poor families, and cholera cases and other cases were distributed among the income classes similarly. Homeopaths were consulted fairly commonly for treating cholera in children, and physicians were commonly consulted for treating adult cholera patients. Females, between 20-29, were treated outside more often than males, possibly due to their reluctance to go to a hospital.

The outside consultation of Shigella cases was more common (58%) than cholera cases (26.3%). This may be due to less acuteness of Shigella cases providing longer time for hospitalization. Hysicians were consulted more often for male (15.2%) than for female (8.9%), which may be a reflection of social attitudes showing different treatment according to sex. People over 50 were also less commonly treated before attending CRL. This also may be due to the lowering of importance in the family with an increase in age.

In cases of other diarrhoa, nearly 48% of the people consulted someone and about 10% of the children were treated by homeopaths. Males were preferably treated by qualified physicians than females.

- 15 -

The types of medicines used outside were interesting. According to priority, patients were prescribed tablets, mixtures, capsules (Tetracycline) and pulves. Only 2.3% of patients were treated with saline before attending UnL though most of them received saline after admission. The chances of receiving saline prior to coming to the hospital were similar for cholera, shigellosis and other types of diarrhea.

The average cost for treating children below 9 was more for male than for female children, but the cost was higher for female than male of the age group 20-29 years. It is interesting to note that the cost for treatment of all diarrheal cases were identical although it was leas for children and old people. The average cost for those who sought medical care was only Tk. 12.50; for those who could not or did seek treatment outside it was Tk. 4.70. This amount may be half a day's to one day's wage of a labourer.

While the absolute amount spent on treating a case was directly proportional to the family income, it is interesting to note that the proportion of family income spent on a case was relatively constant regardless of income. While the cost of treating the average case from a family earning Tk. 600 or more per month was 279% higher than the amount spent on an

- 10 -

average case from a family with an income of under Tk. 300/month, wealthier family spent only 8% more in terms of the percentage of family income. This illustrates a very strong economic influence on the availability of medical care. It also indicates that a rather constant proportion of family income is spent on medical care.

In spite of the existence of hospital and qualified physicians in the city, only 10.3% of cholera cases out of 26.3% seeking treatment consulted either hospitals or qualified physicians. For treatment of shigellosis, nearly 26% of patients out of 58% seeking treatment, consulted physicians and hospitals. In case of non-specific diarrnea, the attitude was similar.

From the attendance (3.7%) of the diarrheal patients in free city hospitals (other than CKL), it is apparent that the hospital treatment is not popular. The qualified physicians, on the other hand, have to compete with the cheap and easily available homeopaths, quacks, pharmacists and the socio-cultural attitude in delivering their scientific allopathic medical care to the people.

- 17 --